



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/471,072	12/21/1999	EDUARDO PELEGRI-LLOPART	SUN1P254/P41	6969

22434 7590 10/14/2004

BEYER WEAVER & THOMAS LLP
P.O. BOX 778
BERKELEY, CA 94704-0778

EXAMINER

ART UNIT PAPER NUMBER

DATE MAILED: 10/14/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

20/9

Notification of Non-Compliant Appeal Brief (37 CFR 41.37)	Application No. 09/471,072	Applicant(s) PELEGRI-LLOPART ET AL	
	Examiner Eric B. Kiss	Art Unit 2122	

--The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

The Appeal Brief filed on 9/23/2004 is defective for failure to comply with one or more provisions of 37 CFR 41.37.

To avoid dismissal of the appeal, applicant must file a complete new brief in compliance with 37 CFR 41.37 within **ONE MONTH or THIRTY DAYS** from the mailing date of this Notification, whichever is longer. **EXTENSIONS OF THIS TIME PERIOD MAY BE GRANTED UNDER 37 CFR 1.136.**

1. ☒ The brief does not contain the items required under 37 CFR 41.37(c), or the items are not under the proper heading or in the proper order.
2. ☐ The brief does not contain a statement of the status of all claims, (e.g., rejected, allowed or confirmed, withdrawn, objected to, canceled), or does not identify the appealed claims (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(iii)).
3. ☐ At least one amendment has been filed subsequent to the final rejection, and the brief does not contain a statement of the status of each such amendment (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(iv)).
4. ☒ (a) The brief does not contain a concise explanation of the subject matter defined in each of the independent claims involved in the appeal, referring to the specification by page and line number and to the drawings, if any, by reference characters; and/or (b) the brief fails to: (1) identify, for each independent claim involved in the appeal and for each dependent claim argued separately, every means plus function and step plus function under 35 U.S.C. 112, sixth paragraph, and/or (2) set forth the structure, material, or acts described in the specification as corresponding to each claimed function with reference to the specification by page and line number, and to the drawings, if any, by reference characters (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(v)).
5. ☒ The brief does not contain a concise statement of each ground of rejection presented for review (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(vi)).
6. ☒ The brief does not present an argument under a separate heading for each ground of rejection on appeal (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(vii)).
7. ☐ The brief does not contain a correct copy of the appealed claims as an appendix thereto (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(viii)).
8. ☐ The brief does not contain copies of the evidence submitted under 37 CFR 1.130, 1.131, or 1.132 or of any other evidence entered by the examiner and relied upon by appellant in the appeal, along with a statement setting forth where in the record that evidence was entered by the examiner, as an appendix thereto (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(ix)).
9. ☐ The brief does not contain copies of the decisions rendered by a court or the Board in the proceeding identified in the Related Appeals and Interferences section of the brief as an appendix thereto (37 CFR 41.37(c)(1)(x)).
10. ☒ Other (including any explanation in support of the above items):

To better assist Applicant in correcting the noted deficiencies, the Examiner has attached a copy of a memo titled, "Clarification of the Effective Date Provision in the Rules of Practice before the Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences (Final Rule)." The Examiner has also attached a copy of 37 CFR §41.37.


TUAN DAM
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER

Clarification of the Effective Date Provision in the Rules of Practice before the Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences (Final Rule)

The effective date provision in the Rules of Practice before the Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences (Final Rule) (hereinafter BPAI final rule) states that September 13, 2004 is the effective date. See Rules of Practice Before the Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences (Final Rule), 69 Fed. Reg. 49959 (August 12, 2004). The U.S. Patent and Trademark Office (Office) has received inquiries as to how the effective date provision applies to certain situations. This notice provides clarification as to how the Office is implementing the effective date provision.

Generally, any paper filed by applicants or mailed by the Office on or after September 13, 2004 must comply with the rules as set forth in the BPAI final rule. Appeal briefs filed prior to September 13, 2004 must either comply with former § 1.192 or new § 41.37. A certificate of mailing or transmission in compliance with § 1.8 will be applicable to determine if a paper was filed prior to the effective date of September 13, 2004 in order to determine which rule applies. Examples of certain situations are set forth in the questions and answers below. Additional questions and answers concerning the BPAI final rule are available on the USPTO web site at www.uspto.gov.

Questions related to Time Periods for Filing of Papers Related to After Final Practice and Ex Parte Appeals:

Question 1. If a notice of appeal is filed before September 13, 2004, the effective date of the BPAI final rule, when is the appeal brief due?

If the notice of appeal is filed before September 13, 2004, the time period for filing an appeal brief will be the time period set forth in former § 1.192(a) which provides that the appellant must file an appeal brief: (1) within two months from the date of filing of the notice of appeal; or (2) within the time allowed for reply to the action from which the appeal was taken, if such time is later.

The time period set forth in former § 1.192(a) also applies if the notice of appeal is filed with a certificate of mailing or transmission in compliance with § 1.8 and the date on the certificate of mailing or transmission is before the effective date of September 13, 2004, but the notice of appeal is received by the Office on or after September 13, 2004. The two month time period will begin on the date of receipt of the notice of appeal.

Question 2. If appellant reinstates the appeal after the prosecution is reopened by filing a second notice of appeal on or after the effective date, when is the second appeal brief due?

Appellant must file the second appeal brief (in compliance with the format and content requirements of § 41.37(c)) within two months from the date of filing the second notice of appeal, even if the first notice of appeal and the first brief were filed before the effective date. The two month time period is extendable under the provisions of § 1.136 for patent applications and § 1.550(c) for *ex parte* reexamination proceedings. See § 41.37(e).

Question 3. If a notice of appeal is filed on or after the effective date of September 13, 2004, would extensions of time under § 1.136(a) be required when a Request for Continued Examination (RCE) under § 1.114 or an amendment is filed after two months from the date of filing the notice of appeal, but within three months from the mailing of the action from which the appeal was taken?

Yes, extensions of time under § 1.136(a) are required for filing an RCE or amendment after two months from the filing of the notice of appeal, even if the RCE or amendment is filed within the three months from the mailing of the action from which the appeal was taken.

Questions related to Appeal Brief Contents or Requirements for Papers Filed after Appeal:

Question 4. If the notice of appeal is filed before the effective date of September 13, 2004 and the brief is filed by appellant on or after the effective date, would the appeal brief be required to comply with the content and format requirements of § 41.37(c)?

Yes, any appeal brief filed on or after September 13, 2004 must be in compliance with the requirements set forth in § 41.37(c) and be accompanied by the appropriate fee under § 41.20(b)(2). If the brief does not comply with § 41.37(c), an amended brief will be required under § 41.37(d).

Exception: If the appeal brief is filed with a certificate of mailing or transmission under § 1.8 and the date on the certificate of mailing or transmission is before September 13, 2004, the appeal brief may comply with either former § 1.192 or new § 41.37, even if the appeal brief is received by the Office on or after September 13, 2004.

Question 5. Would the Office accept an appeal brief filed before the effective date of September 13, 2004 that is in compliance with § 41.37(c)?

Yes, a brief filed before September 13, 2004 that is compliant with the new § 41.37(c) will be acceptable.

Question 6. If an appeal brief filed before the effective date of September 13, 2004 fails to comply with the content and format requirements of § 1.192 and the Office mails appellant a Notice that correction is required, would an amended appeal brief filed on or after the effective date be required to be in compliance with § 41.37(c)?

No, an amended appeal brief, based on an appeal brief originally filed prior to September 13, 2004, would be acceptable if it complies with either former § 1.192 or § 41.37(c), regardless of when the Office mailed a Notice requiring correction of the noncompliant appeal brief.

Question 7. If, after a final rejection or an appeal, applicant or appellant filed an amendment, affidavit or other evidence on or after the effective date, will the revised or new rules in the BPAI final rule apply?

Any affidavit or other evidence filed after a final rejection, or an appeal, on or after the effective date, will be subject to the revised or new rules (*i.e.*, the revised § 1.116 or new § 41.33).

Questions related to Examiner's Answers and Supplemental Examiner's Answers:

Question 8. If the appeal brief is filed before the effective date of September 13, 2004, but the examiner's answer is mailed on or after the effective date, can the examiner's answer include a new ground of rejection?

Yes, an examiner's answer mailed on or after September 13, 2004 may include a new ground of rejection (with Technology Center Director or designee approval) in compliance with § 41.39. Any examiner's answer mailed before September 13, 2004, however, may not include a new ground of rejection. See former § 1.193.

Question 9. Can the examiner provide a supplemental examiner's answer under § 41.43 on or after the effective date of September 13, 2004 in response to any new issue raised in a reply brief that was filed before the effective date?

Yes, the examiner may provide a supplemental examiner's answer (with Technology Center Director or designee approval) if it is mailed on or after September 13, 2004 in response to any new issue raised in a reply brief, even if the reply brief was filed before September 13, 2004. Appellant may file another reply brief in compliance with § 41.41 to reply to the supplemental examiner's answer within two months from the date of mailing of the supplemental examiner's answer. Extensions of time under § 1.136(a) are not applicable to the two-month time period.

Question 10. If the Board remanded an application before the effective date of September 13, 2004 for further consideration of a rejection, and the examiner provides a supplemental examiner's answer on or after the effective date (in response to the remand by the Board), can appellant request that prosecution be reopened under § 41.50(a)(2)(i)?

No, appellant may not request that prosecution be reopened under § 41.50(a)(2)(i) in response to the supplemental examiner's answer since the Board remanded the application before the effective date. Appellant may request that prosecution be reopened in response to a supplemental examiner's answer written in response to the remand by the Board, only if: (1) the remand is on or after the effective date, and (2) the remand is for further consideration of a rejection. The Board should indicate in the remand if § 41.50(a)(2)(i) applies. Thus, appellant may not request that prosecution be reopened under § 41.50(a)(2)(i) if the remand is for another reason.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Kery Fries, Senior Legal Advisor in the Office of Patent Legal Administration, by telephone at (703) 308-6906 or (571) 272-7704 on or after September 29, 2004, or by e-mail addressed to Kery.Fries@USPTO.gov.

/s/ Robert J. Spar, for
Stephen G. Kunin
Deputy Commissioner
for Patent Examination Policy

(c) An appeal, when taken, must be taken from the rejection of all claims under rejection which the applicant or owner proposes to contest. Questions relating to matters not affecting the merits of the invention may be required to be settled before an appeal can be considered.

(d) The time periods set forth in paragraphs (a)(1) through (a)(3) of this section are extendable under the provisions of § 1.136 of this title for patent applications and § 1.550(c) of this title for ex parte reexamination proceedings.

§ 41.33 Amendments and affidavits or other evidence after appeal.

(a) Amendments filed after the date of filing an appeal pursuant to § 41.31(a)(1) through (a)(3) and prior to the date a brief is filed pursuant to § 41.37 may be admitted as provided in § 1.116 of this title.

(b) Amendments filed on or after the date of filing a brief pursuant to § 41.37 may be admitted:

(1) To cancel claims, where such cancellation does not affect the scope of any other pending claim in the proceeding, or

(2) To rewrite dependent claims into independent form.

(c) All other amendments filed after the date of filing an appeal pursuant to § 41.31(a)(1) through (a)(3) will not be admitted except as permitted by §§ 41.39(b)(1), 41.50(a)(2)(i), 41.50(b)(1) and 41.50(c).

(d)(1) An affidavit or other evidence filed after the date of filing an appeal pursuant to § 41.31(a)(1) through (a)(3) and prior to the date of filing a brief pursuant to § 41.37 may be admitted if the examiner determines that the affidavit or other evidence overcomes all rejections under appeal and that a showing of good and sufficient reasons why the affidavit or other evidence is necessary and was not earlier presented has been made.

(2) All other affidavits or other evidence filed after the date of filing an appeal pursuant to § 41.31(a)(1) through (a)(3) will not be admitted except as permitted by §§ 41.39(b)(1), 41.50(a)(2)(i) and 41.50(b)(1).

§ 41.35 Jurisdiction over appeal.

(a) Jurisdiction over the proceeding passes to the Board upon transmittal of the file, including all briefs and examiner's answers, to the Board.

(b) If, after receipt and review of the proceeding, the Board determines that the file is not complete or is not in compliance with the requirements of this subpart, the Board may relinquish jurisdiction to the examiner or take

other appropriate action to permit completion of the file.

(c) Prior to the entry of a decision on the appeal by the Board, the Director may sua sponte order the proceeding remanded to the examiner.

§ 41.37 Appeal brief.

(a)(1) Appellant must file a brief under this section within two months from the date of filing the notice of appeal under § 41.31.

(2) The brief must be accompanied by the fee set forth in § 41.20(b)(2).

(b) On failure to file the brief, accompanied by the requisite fee, within the period specified in paragraph (a) of this section, the appeal will stand dismissed.

(c)(1) The brief shall contain the following items under appropriate headings and in the order indicated in paragraphs (c)(1)(i) through (c)(1)(x) of this section, except that a brief filed by an appellant who is not represented by a registered practitioner need only substantially comply with paragraphs (c)(1)(i) through (c)(1)(iv) and (c)(1)(vii) through (c)(1)(x) of this section:

(i) *Real party in interest.* A statement identifying by name the real party in interest.

(ii) *Related appeals and interferences.* A statement identifying by application, patent, appeal or interference number all other prior and pending appeals, interferences or judicial proceedings known to appellant, the appellant's legal representative, or assignee which may be related to, directly affect or be directly affected by or have a bearing on the Board's decision in the pending appeal. Copies of any decisions rendered by a court or the Board in any proceeding identified under this paragraph must be included in an appendix as required by paragraph (c)(1)(x) of this section.

(iii) *Status of claims.* A statement of the status of all the claims in the proceeding (e.g., rejected, allowed or confirmed, withdrawn, objected to, canceled) and an identification of those claims that are being appealed.

(iv) *Status of amendments.* A statement of the status of any amendment filed subsequent to final rejection.

(v) *Summary of claimed subject matter.* A concise explanation of the subject matter defined in each of the independent claims involved in the appeal, which shall refer to the specification by page and line number, and to the drawing, if any, by reference characters. For each independent claim involved in the appeal and for each dependent claim argued separately under the provisions of paragraph

(c)(1)(vii) of this section, every means plus function and step plus function as permitted by 35 U.S.C. 112, sixth paragraph, must be identified and the structure, material, or acts described in the specification as corresponding to each claimed function must be set forth with reference to the specification by page and line number, and to the drawing, if any, by reference characters.

(vi) *Grounds of rejection to be reviewed on appeal.* A concise statement of each ground of rejection presented for review.

(vii) *Argument.* The contentions of appellant with respect to each ground of rejection presented for review in paragraph (c)(1)(vi) of this section, and the basis therefor, with citations of the statutes, regulations, authorities, and parts of the record relied on. Any arguments or authorities not included in the brief or a reply brief filed pursuant to § 41.41 will be refused consideration by the Board, unless good cause is shown. Each ground of rejection must be treated under a separate heading. For each ground of rejection applying to two or more claims, the claims may be argued separately or as a group. When multiple claims subject to the same ground of rejection are argued as a group by appellant, the Board may select a single claim from the group of claims that are argued together to decide the appeal with respect to the group of claims as to the ground of rejection on the basis of the selected claim alone. Notwithstanding any other provision of this paragraph, the failure of appellant to separately argue claims which appellant has grouped together shall constitute a waiver of any argument that the Board must consider the patentability of any grouped claim separately. Any claim argued separately should be placed under a subheading identifying the claim by number. Claims argued as a group should be placed under a subheading identifying the claims by number. A statement which merely points out what a claim recites will not be considered an argument for separate patentability of the claim.

(viii) *Claims appendix.* An appendix containing a copy of the claims involved in the appeal.

(ix) *Evidence appendix.* An appendix containing copies of any evidence submitted pursuant to §§ 1.130, 1.131, or 1.132 of this title or of any other evidence entered by the examiner and relied upon by appellant in the appeal, along with a statement setting forth where in the record that evidence was entered in the record by the examiner. Reference to unentered evidence is not permitted in the brief. See § 41.33 for treatment of evidence submitted after

appeal. This appendix may also include copies of the evidence relied upon by the examiner as to grounds of rejection to be reviewed on appeal.

(x) *Related proceedings appendix.* An appendix containing copies of decisions rendered by a court or the Board in any proceeding identified pursuant to paragraph (c)(1)(ii) of this section.

(2) A brief shall not include any new or non-admitted amendment, or any new or non-admitted affidavit or other evidence. See § 1.116 of this title for amendments, affidavits or other evidence filed after final action but before or on the same date of filing an appeal and § 41.33 for amendments, affidavits or other evidence filed after the date of filing the appeal.

(d) If a brief is filed which does not comply with all the requirements of paragraph (c) of this section, appellant will be notified of the reasons for non-compliance and given a time period within which to file an amended brief. If appellant does not file an amended brief within the set time period, or files an amended brief which does not overcome all the reasons for non-compliance stated in the notification, the appeal will stand dismissed.

(e) The time periods set forth in this section are extendable under the provisions of § 1.136 of this title for patent applications and § 1.550(c) of this title for ex parte reexamination proceedings.

§ 41.39 Examiner's answer.

(a)(1) The primary examiner may, within such time as may be directed by the Director, furnish a written answer to the appeal brief including such explanation of the invention claimed and of the references relied upon and grounds of rejection as may be necessary, supplying a copy to appellant. If the primary examiner determines that the appeal does not comply with the provisions of §§ 41.31 and 41.37 or does not relate to an appealable action, the primary examiner shall make such determination of record.

(2) An examiner's answer may include a new ground of rejection.

(b) If an examiner's answer contains a rejection designated as a new ground of rejection, appellant must within two months from the date of the examiner's answer exercise one of the following two options to avoid sua sponte dismissal of the appeal as to the claims subject to the new ground of rejection:

(1) *Reopen prosecution.* Request that prosecution be reopened before the primary examiner by filing a reply under § 1.111 of this title with or without amendment or submission of

affidavits (§§ 1.130, 1.131 or 1.132 of this title) or other evidence. Any amendment or submission of affidavits or other evidence must be relevant to the new ground of rejection. A request that complies with this paragraph will be entered and the application or the patent under ex parte reexamination will be reconsidered by the examiner under the provisions of § 1.112 of this title. Any request that prosecution be reopened under this paragraph will be treated as a request to withdraw the appeal.

(2) *Maintain appeal.* Request that the appeal be maintained by filing a reply brief as set forth in § 41.41. Such a reply brief must address each new ground of rejection as set forth in § 41.37(c)(1)(vii) and should follow the other requirements of a brief as set forth in § 41.37(c). A reply brief may not be accompanied by any amendment, affidavit (§§ 1.130, 1.131 or 1.132 of this title) or other evidence. If a reply brief filed pursuant to this section is accompanied by any amendment, affidavit or other evidence, it shall be treated as a request that prosecution be reopened before the primary examiner under paragraph (b)(1) of this section.

(c) Extensions of time under § 1.136(a) of this title for patent applications are not applicable to the time period set forth in this section. See § 1.136(b) of this title for extensions of time to reply for patent applications and § 1.550(c) of this title for extensions of time to reply for ex parte reexamination proceedings.

§ 41.41 Reply brief.

(a)(1) Appellant may file a reply brief to an examiner's answer within two months from the date of the examiner's answer.

(2) A reply brief shall not include any new or non-admitted amendment, or any new or non-admitted affidavit or other evidence. See § 1.116 of this title for amendments, affidavits or other evidence filed after final action but before or on the same date of filing an appeal and § 41.33 for amendments, affidavits or other evidence filed after the date of filing the appeal.

(b) A reply brief that is not in compliance with paragraph (a) of this section will not be considered. Appellant will be notified if a reply brief is not in compliance with paragraph (a) of this section.

(c) Extensions of time under § 1.136(a) of this title for patent applications are not applicable to the time period set forth in this section. See § 1.136(b) of this title for extensions of time to reply for patent applications and § 1.550(c) of this title for extensions of time to reply for ex parte reexamination proceedings.

§ 41.43 Examiner's response to reply brief.

(a)(1) After receipt of a reply brief in compliance with § 41.41, the primary examiner must acknowledge receipt and entry of the reply brief. In addition, the primary examiner may withdraw the final rejection and reopen prosecution or may furnish a supplemental examiner's answer responding to any new issue raised in the reply brief.

(2) A supplemental examiner's answer responding to a reply brief may not include a new ground of rejection.

(b) If a supplemental examiner's answer is furnished by the examiner, appellant may file another reply brief under § 41.41 to any supplemental examiner's answer within two months from the date of the supplemental examiner's answer.

(c) Extensions of time under § 1.136(a) of this title for patent applications are not applicable to the time period set forth in this section. See § 1.136(b) of this title for extensions of time to reply for patent applications and § 1.550(c) of this title for extensions of time to reply for ex parte reexamination proceedings.

§ 41.47 Oral hearing.

(a) An oral hearing should be requested only in those circumstances in which appellant considers such a hearing necessary or desirable for a proper presentation of the appeal. An appeal decided on the briefs without an oral hearing will receive the same consideration by the Board as appeals decided after an oral hearing.

(b) If appellant desires an oral hearing, appellant must file, as a separate paper captioned "REQUEST FOR ORAL HEARING," a written request for such hearing accompanied by the fee set forth in § 41.20(b)(3) within two months from the date of the examiner's answer or supplemental examiner's answer.

(c) If no request and fee for oral hearing have been timely filed by appellant as required by paragraph (b) of this section, the appeal will be assigned for consideration and decision on the briefs without an oral hearing.

(d) If appellant has complied with all the requirements of paragraph (b) of this section, a date for the oral hearing will be set, and due notice thereof given to appellant. If an oral hearing is held, an oral argument may be presented by, or on behalf of, the primary examiner if considered desirable by either the primary examiner or the Board. A hearing will be held as stated in the notice, and oral argument will ordinarily be limited to twenty minutes for appellant and fifteen minutes for the primary examiner unless otherwise ordered.